

राष्ट्रीय राजमार्ग एवं अवसंरचना विकास निगम लिमिटेड
National Highways & Infrastructure Development Corporation Ltd.
(Assam Division)

Minutes of the meeting of Empowered Technical Evaluation Committee (ETEC) held on 26.12.2017 for “Consultancy Services for Authority’s Engineer for Supervision of Four laning of Dolabari to Jamuguri section from km 17.300 of NH-37A to km 182.000 of NH-52 in the State of Assam under SARDP- NE, Phase A”.

1. Having carried out technical evaluation, ETEC in its meeting dated 27.09.2017 recommended for seeking comments from all the participated bidders on the carried out technical evaluation within 7 days. Out of the five bidders, four bidders viz. (i) M/s Louis Berger Consulting Pvt Ltd - Wadia Techno Engineering Services Ltd (JV), (ii) M/s L.N. Malviya Infra Projects Pvt Ltd, (iii) M/s Feedback Infra Pvt. Ltd and (iv) M/s Yooshin Engineering Corporation in association with Casta Engineers Pvt Ltd have submitted their comments on the evaluation results whereas M/s TPF Getinsa Euroestudios S.L. - Rodic Consultants Pvt Ltd (JV) has not offered any comments in response.
2. While examining the comments received from the bidders, ETEC observed that certain selections (as mentioned in **Annexure-I**) for some Key Personnel (Team Leader cum Sr. Bridge Engineer and Highway Design Specialist) have inadvertently got omitted in the input sheets of INFRACON despite being included in the RFP. Also, some companies could not be mapped with the bidder’s companies on INFRACON which affected the marks for “employment of the Key Personnel with the firm”. ETEC further noted that the factors for past experience of the firms had been inadvertently taken in form of percentage instead of decimal value and as such the length calculated by INFRACON against the various eligibility parameters for firms got enhanced by a factor of 100. Having incorporated the required changes in the input sheets, the re-evaluation has been carried out on INFRACON portal.
3. ETEC on carrying out re-evaluation on INFRACON portal observed that there is some variation in the scores obtained by a firm, M/s TPF Getinsa Euroestudios S.L. - Rodic Consultants Pvt Ltd (JV), in re-evaluation and the previous evaluation. ETEC noted that in the previous evaluation, some of the Key Personnel had scored marks for “employment of the Key Personnel with the firm” even when the end date of association with the firm is prior to the bid due date which has subsequently been rectified by the INFRACON support team.
4. ETEC in its previous meeting dated 27.09.2017 had carried out manual evaluation w.r.t. 500 m bridge criteria and superimposed the obtained score with the already determined score by INFRACON. In this meeting dated 04.12.2017, ETEC considered the claims of the bidders w.r.t. 500 m bridge criteria and opined that marks claimed by M/s Feedback Infra Pvt. Ltd for experience in construction of ROB/ flyover (project at S. no. 4 &16 of Moved Data) should also be considered as relevant experience. As a result, the score of M/s Feedback Infra Pvt has been increased from 4 to 6 for this experience criterion. Marks claimed by other bidders have either already been considered in the evaluation or the claims were not found tenable.



5. The Committee also noted that one key personnel of M/s L. N. Malviya Infra Projects Pvt Ltd i.e. Highway Design Specialist and two key personnel of M/s Yooshin Engineering Corporation in association with Casta Engineers Pvt Ltd i.e. Bridge Design Specialist & Resident Engineer cum pavement specialist & road safety expert have failed to score minimum required 75 marks which is less than maximum 3 replacements allowed as per clause 3.4 (iv) (f) of RFP. If any of the two firms emerge as H₁ bidder, it shall be asked to produce replacement of these key personnel with appropriate qualification and experience before contract negotiation.


6. Committee noted that M/s Feedback Infra Pvt Ltd is to be provisionally qualified as per the decision in the 38th meeting of Executive Committee, NHIDCL (Minutes of meeting of 38th Executive Committee are placed at **Annexure II**). Further, the Committee observed that one of the bidders, M/s Louis Berger Consulting Pvt Ltd - Wadia Techno Engineering Services Ltd (JV), is ineligible in the First Stage Evaluation as other member, M/s Wadia Techno Engineering Services Ltd, could not fulfil the other member criteria but the bidder was shown eligible due to systemic error in the earlier evaluation.

7. Consequent to the observations of ETEC at para 2, 3, 4 & 6 above, the modified score/ status of the firms is mentioned below:

S. No.	Name of Bidder	First Stage Evaluation	Second Stage Evaluation		Status for opening of Financial Proposal as per clause 7
			Technical Score of Firm out of 100	Technical Score of Team Leader cum Sr. Bridge Engineer	
1	M/s TPF Getinsa Euroestudios S.L. - Rodic Consultants Pvt Ltd (JV)	Eligible	93.75	93.00	Responsive
2	M/s Louis Berger Consulting Pvt Ltd - Wadia Techno Engineering Services Ltd (JV)	Not Eligible due to M/s Wadia Techno Engineering Services Ltd not fulfilling the eligibility criteria	Not considered due to becoming ineligible in the First Stage		Non Responsive
3	M/s L.N. Malviya Infra Projects Pvt Ltd	Eligible	85.75	92.50	Responsive
4	M/s Feedback Infra Pvt. Ltd	Eligible	92.86	88	Provisionally Responsive
5	M/s Yooshin Engineering Corporation in association with Casta Engineers Pvt Ltd	Eligible	83.99	96.88	Responsive

8. Finally, the Committee recommended seeking comments from all the four responsive bidders on the revised technical evaluation within 7 days.

Meeting ended with Vote of thanks to Chair


Rahul Gupta
ED-II
Convener
*Lmk off Cn
ED-III*


Adil Singh
GM (Tech)
Member Secretary


Sandeep Kumar
GM (Tech)
Member


B K Nath
DGM (Tech)
Presenting Officer


Uttam Chatterjee
DGM (Fin)
Member